

Appendix A
Evaluation of the Prior Housing Element

This page intentionally left blank.

Table A-1
Housing Element Program Evaluation 2014-2019
City of Cathedral City

Program/Action	Responsible Agency	Schedule	Accomplishments	Future Policies and Actions
<i>GOAL 1: A broad range of housing types located in all the City's neighborhoods, which meets the needs of all existing and future households.</i>				
<i>Policy 1.A</i>				
<i>Ensure that sufficient residentially designated lands and appropriate zoning exist to meet the City's future housing needs.</i>				
Program 1.A.1 Maintain the list of affordable housing sites as shown in Table III-15, Inventory of Available Vacant Lands, and update the list annually to include lands in the North City Specific Plan area as infrastructure is extended to this area.	Community Development Department	Annually through 2021	The list of affordable housing sites is updated periodically. A current update is underway.	Continue
Program 1.A.2 Maintain land use and zoning designations in the General Plan and zoning maps that allow for diversity of housing types and densities.	Community Development Department	On-going	Land use and zoning designations were maintained. The 2040 General Plan Update will increase potential housing units from 32,834 to 33,396 potential units at buildout.	Continue
Program 1.A.3 Maintain a Planned Unit Development (PUD) permit ordinance which allows flexibility in development standards to encourage housing construction while preserving natural resources.	Community Development Department	On-going	PUD ordinance was maintained.	Continue
Program 1.A.4 Negotiate the inclusion of affordable housing, including units targeted for extremely-low-income households when feasible, in Specific Plans, PUDs, and Tentative Tract Maps with each developer as application is made. The negotiation may include the provision of financial incentives, if available, accelerated review process, or development standard concessions in exchange for deed restricted affordable units within each project with priority for projects that include extremely-low-income units.	Community Development Department	On-going with each development application	No inclusionary housing has been required on any project to date within the 5 th Cycle RHNA.	Continue

Program/Action	Responsible Agency	Schedule	Accomplishments	Future Policies and Actions
Program 1.A.5 The City will provide technical assistance to property owners and developers in support of lot consolidation, including identifying opportunities for potential consolidation and incentives to encourage consolidation of parcels, as appropriate.	Community Development Department, Housing Successor Agency	On-going as part of the development application process	Emphasis on lot consolidation for Downtown properties, three of which are greater than 6 acres (Grit Development; Cat Canyon Development; Cathedral Cove Development of 13.5 Acres), as well as the Newport 5, Mountain View, River Canyon and The District residential projects.	Continue
Program 1.A.6 Promote development of mixed-use projects in the Downtown area which combine high-density residential with local commercial services. Post a list of vacant or underutilized residential sites on the City web site as part of a page dedicated to development opportunities in the Downtown area.	Housing Successor Agency, Economic Development	On-going as part of the development application process; annual updates to the list of vacant and underutilized sites	The City, specifically the Economic Development Division, continually promotes the Downtown area for high-density mixed-use development. Available parcels are posted and promoted on the City's website. Meetings and negotiations with property owners and interested developers are ongoing. Several potential mixed-use development proposals have been discussed and pursued through the entitlement phase, although none have been completed to date.	Continue
Program 1.A.7 The City shall rezone either Assessor's Parcel 677-050-017, which consists of 14.69 acres and could generate 294 units; or Assessor's Parcel 677-050-018, which consists of 18.12 acres, and could generate 362 units to address the unaccommodated need from the prior planning period. Pursuant to Government Code Section 65583.2(h), the rezoned site will allow rental and owner multifamily uses by right and require a minimum density of 20 units per acre.	Community Development Department	2014	Both parcels were re-zoned to R4 (High to High High-Density Multi-family) with a minimum density of 20 DUA and a maximum of 24 DUA. At the landowner's request, they were both re-zoned to R-3 (Medium to High Density Multi-family). R3 allows for a maximum density of 20 DUA. A realistic capacity analysis determined that a density of 20 DUA was appropriate based on recent affordable housing developments in the Coachella Valley. Pursuant to Government Code 65863 (SB 166, No Net Loss), the City evaluated the	Program to be continued for new sites. Inventory Site 9 (APN 677-190-037) to be re-designated with General Plan Update to RH/R-3.

Program/Action	Responsible Agency	Schedule	Accomplishments	Future Policies and Actions
			<p>landowner's request for re-zoning to R3 to determine if there were sufficient replacement sites to accommodate the short fall within the 5th cycle RHNA. The City's 5th cycle RHNA allocation was 236 units for low-, very-low- and extremely-low-income units. The inventory of sites could accommodate 1,561 lower-income units in the DRN, MXC, MF-2 and R-3 zones, which exceeded the lower-income RHNA allocation by 1,325 units. Therefore, the City determined there were sufficient replacement sites to accommodate the short fall.</p> <p>The change in zone results in a shortage of between 3 and 4 units per parcel, but only if the parcel(s) are developed to the maximum R3 density.</p>	
Policy 1.B <i>Provide a sufficient variety of housing types to meet the housing needs of all residents, regardless of race, religion, sex, marital status, ancestry, sexual orientation, nationality, or color.</i>				
Program 1.B.1 In order to reduce infrastructure cost, the City will encourage infill development and the remodeling or addition to existing homes wherever possible through the use of expedited processing and financial incentives, if available.	Community Development Department, Housing Successor Agency	On-going as part of the development application process	The City process for approval of a remodel or expansion of an existing home is a streamlined administrative process. No financial incentives have been available, but this ministerial approval process is significantly less cost prohibitive for an applicant than a discretionary review process.	Continue and combine with Program 1.B.2
Program 1.B.2 Encourage in-fill development in areas that are already serviced with adequate infrastructure, including streets and water and sewer lines, to support build-out of the neighborhood. The City shall consider fee waivers, reductions in development standards, or financial assistance if feasible.	Community Development Department	On-going as part of the development application process	The City process for approval of an in-fill development is a streamlined administrative process. No financial incentives have been available, but this ministerial approval process is significantly less cost prohibitive for an applicant than a discretionary review process.	Continue and combine this with Program 1.B.1

Program/Action	Responsible Agency	Schedule	Accomplishments	Future Policies and Actions
Program 1.B.3 Work with private organizations -- including the Coachella Valley Housing Coalition, Shelter from the Storm, the Senior Center, Desert AIDS Project, Foundation for the Retarded or Braille Institute -- in assisting whenever possible in the housing of disabled residents or those with special housing needs in the City. The City shall consider fee waivers, reductions in development standards, or financial assistance if feasible.	Housing Successor Agency	On-going as part of the development application process; annual outreach	The City as Housing Successor Agency worked with Urban Housing Communities provided land for the project for a significantly reduced price and provided grant money for construction of a 60-unit affordable housing project for Veterans called Veterans Village at Cathedral City (special housing needs group). The City as Housing Successor Agency is providing partial financing and forgiving a significant existing loan for Cathedral Palms extremely low and low income 224-unit senior housing project (special housing needs group).	Continue

Program/Action	Responsible Agency	Schedule	Accomplishments	Future Policies and Actions
Program 1.B.4 Continue to enforce the provisions of the Federal Fair Housing Act. All complaints regarding discrimination in housing will be referred to the Riverside County Office of Fair Housing. Information on the Fair Housing Act, as well as methods of responding to complaints shall be made available at City Hall and at the Library.	Housing Successor Agency	On-going; annual coordination with the Riverside County Office of Fair Housing	The City has provided \$18,000 per year to the Riverside County office of Fair Housing (Inland Fair Housing) and refers all complaints regarding discrimination in housing to that office. Information for filing a complaint is provided on the City's website.	Continue
Program 1.B.5 Continue to work with the Coachella Valley Association of Governments toward a regional solution for homelessness, through support of the Multi Service Center in North Palm Springs, and other efforts as they are developed.	City Manager's office, Housing Successor Agency	On-going coordination with CVAG	<p>The City has provided \$103,000 per year to the Coachella Valley Association of Governments via CDBG Funds and the General Fund. Cooling Centers, such as at the Elk's Lodge, are made available during the seasonally hot months of the year.</p> <p>The City had one dedicated Homeless Liaison Police Officer that has now been expanded to two dedicated officers, both of whom are fully funded. These officers align needs of homeless individuals with available resources. They work to remove homeless individuals from outdoor encampments to permanent housing.</p>	Continue
Program 1.B.6 Work with the Coachella Valley Association of Governments to determine the need for affordable "Workforce Housing" and to promote development of such.	Community Development Department	Within one year of Housing Element adoption	Completed within one year of Housing Element (5 th Cyc) adoption (GPA 14-002).	Continue
Program 1.B.7 Work with the Coachella Valley Association of Governments to determine the need for affordable "Workforce Housing" and promote development of such.	City Manager's office, CVAG Workforce Housing Planning Committee	On-going coordination with CVAG	Code amendments were completed.	This program was completed and is no longer necessary.

Program/Action	Responsible Agency	Schedule	Accomplishments	Future Policies and Actions
Policy 1.C <i>The City shall ensure that new and rehabilitated housing is efficient in its use of energy and natural resources.</i>				
Program 1.C.1 New development and rehabilitation efforts will be required to incorporate energy efficiency through architectural and landscape design and the use of renewable resources and conservation of resources. If available, housing assistance funds shall be considered for projects which provide high levels of energy conservation for affordable housing. Expand the City's support for green building and LEED certified projects to encourage private development participation in these programs as part of future housing projects for all income levels through the pre-application and application review process.	Community Development Department, Environmental Conservation Division	On-going as part of the development application process	Handled as part of a project's ministerial or discretionary approval process. Architectural and landscape design are reviewed for energy and water efficiency, with many post development applications processed for solar panel installation and drought tolerant landscape conversions. Housing assistance funds have not been available through the City.	Continue
Program 1.C.2 A list of known incentives for energy and water conservation measures shall be maintained by the Community Development Department and made available for developers and property owners at the City's reception desk.	Community Development Department, Environmental Conservation Division	Annual review and update of energy and water conservation measures	The City's Public Works Department maintains a list of resources for energy and water conservation measures.	Continue
Policy 1.D <i>Encourage the development of appropriate unit sizes in affordable multi-family rental projects and second units on single family lots.</i>				
Program 1.D.1 Work closely with housing advocates and stakeholders to identify needs in the community based on household size, and develop and support projects that meet those needs. This should include the full range of potential units, from single-room-occupancy units to 4- and 5-bedroom units, depending on the need foreseen in the City during the planning period, through bond financing for affordable housing via the County Housing Authority or other appropriate means.	Community Development Department; Housing Successor Agency	Annual outreach to stakeholders as part of the Housing Element review process	Monthly meetings, "City Hall at Your Corner," where City Council /City Manager go out into the community and have open discussions regarding areas of concern in community Specific projects to accommodate housing needs include Cathedral Palms, which was funded in the previous (5 th) cycle and Veteran's Village at Cathedral City currently under way. Working in partnership with Riverside County to help identify housing needs for Cathedral City.	Continue

Program/Action	Responsible Agency	Schedule	Accomplishments	Future Policies and Actions
Policy 1.E <i>High-density, affordable and senior projects shall be located with convenient access to shopping, public transit, schools, parks, and public facilities such as streets and sidewalks.</i>				
Program 1.E.1 Require developers of affordable and senior housing projects to confer with SunLine Transit regarding the provision of service to the project.	Community Development Department	On-going as part of the development application	Sunline has been notified of all proposed projects, including affordable and senior housing projects, to determine whether or not service/turnouts are required to be provided if this is not already being done. The City includes any required physical changes in the project's "conditions of approval" for implementation by the developer (case-by-case). Sunline uses the development data to determine any necessary existing or future changes to service. All proposed projects continue to be discussed with SunLine, to determine whether or not service/turnouts will be required.	Continue
Policy 1.F <i>Ensure that affordable housing projects are available for hotel and service industry employees.</i>				
Program 1.F.1 Continue to work with CVAG and the Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians toward development of workforce housing, including Tribal lands in the City which may be appropriate for affordable housing.	Community Development Department	On-going coordination with CVAG and Tribal government	The City has been an active participant in CVAG's Homeless Task Force and has contributed toward development of homeless housing solutions in the Coachella Valley. The majority of vacant Indian-controlled parcels in the City are allotted and outside the control of the Agua Caliente Tribal Council; however, the Tribe's development of the Downtown casino presents an opportunity for partnering on workforce housing opportunities.	Continue

Program/Action	Responsible Agency	Schedule	Accomplishments	Future Policies and Actions
GOAL 2: Facilitate the development of affordable housing for extremely-low-, very-low-, low- and moderate-income households.				
Policy 2.A <i>In order to leverage local investment, promote and facilitate the use of State and federal monies for the development and rehabilitation of affordable housing in the community.</i>				
Program 2.A.1 The City shall encourage and assist self-help housing funded by non-profit organizations for single family and infill development.	Housing Successor Agency	On-going coordination as part of the development application process and annual Housing Element review	None between 2014-2019 (possibly due to the recession)	Continue under the Community Development Department
Program 2.A.2 Continue to distribute the City's information for developers and low-income households which detail the programs available to both parties for assistance in the development and rehabilitation of low income housing at City Hall, the Senior Center, and the Desert Valleys Builders Association (DVBA) offices.	Housing Successor Agency	On-going posting of information	No materials/programs are currently available from the City. The City's website refers to Riverside County's assistance/materials/programs.	Continue under the Planning and Building Department
Program 2.A.3 Should the City be notified of intent to sell or convert any at-risk affordable housing developments, all possible funding sources, including CDBG funds and appropriate grant funds, if available, will be considered to facilitate purchase of such a project. All non-profit organizations that have expressed an interest in purchasing such projects, including the Riverside County Economic Development Agency Housing Authority and other non-profit groups will be notified immediately of any such properties for sale or at risk of losing affordability restrictions. This will be done in accordance with AB 987. The City will communicate with the property owner at least one year prior to the earliest release date of affordability restrictions.	Housing Successor Agency	On-going monitoring; coordination with owners of properties proposed for conversion and non-profit organizations one year prior to the earliest release date.	Monitoring is ongoing; no notification has been received within the 5th Cycle RHNA of an intent to convert or sell any at risk affordable housing developments. The City is financially participating in the renovation of the Cathedral Palms housing development	Continue under the Community Development Department

Program/Action	Responsible Agency	Schedule	Accomplishments	Future Policies and Actions
Program 2.A.4 Maintain and update the database of infill lots throughout the community that would be appropriate for the development of affordable housing for extremely low, very low and low income households, including self-help ownership housing. Promote these parcels in the development community, through brochures, potential streamlined processing incentives, and other means.	Community Development Department	On-going notification as part of the annual Housing Element review process	The City promoted the sale of individual parcels owned by the City, and although the transactions did not have an affordability restriction, the funds received from the sales in total were consolidated and incorporated into the cost of renovating the Cathedral Palms housing project and the development of Veteran's Village at Cathedral City – two significant affordable housing projects. The database has been and continues to be maintained.	Continue under the Community Development Department
Program 2.A.5 Review requests for density bonuses in affordable housing projects on the basis of its requirements.	Community Development Department	On-going notification as part of the annual Housing Element review process	The City's Density Bonus Ordinance is in conformance with state law. No density bonuses have been applied during the 5 th Cycle	Continue
Policy 2.B <i>The Redevelopment Agency shall expend housing set aside funds as effectively as possible to generate the development of new affordable housing units.</i>				
Program 2.B.1 In older neighborhoods where extremely-low, low- and very-low-income households are a significant portion of the residents, consider the assignment of bond proceeds for the improvement of streets, water, sewer, and flood control improvements to bring these facilities into compliance with current standards.	Community Development Department	On-going as part of the annual budget process	Septic systems were replaced in the Cathedral City Cove, Dream Homes, and the 35th Avenue Districts with sewers during or before the 2004-2007 4th Cycle RHNA. The sewers continued to be improved and maintained during the 5th Cycle to ensure that they remain in compliance with current standards. New streets on top of sewers helped with flood control improvements. CDBG eligible funds have been used to install streets, curbs, gutters and sidewalks in low- and moderate-income areas.	Program to be modified to address remaining areas.
Program 2.B.2 Maintain the City's database of affordable housing projects and units, and the Housing Replacement Plan, and develop action plans should these units be converted or destroyed per AB 987.	Housing Successor Agency	On-going as required by AB 987	A database of affordable housing projects and units is maintained on the City's website in accordance with AB 987. No new units are planned to be converted or destroyed.	Continue

Program/Action	Responsible Agency	Schedule	Accomplishments	Future Policies and Actions
Program 2.C.2 The Planning Division shall seek to identify innovative housing solutions for extremely-low-, very-low-, low-income households and the elderly.	Community Development Department	On-going as part of the annual Housing Element review process	<p>City is supportive of affordable housing developers, however the City does not take the lead on “innovative housing solutions.”</p> <p>The City works in partnership with the Riverside County Office of Fair Housing and the Coachella Valley Association of Governments to identify and facilitate innovative housing solutions, such as comprehensively addressing the needs of the homeless, not only in Cathedral City but Valley-wide.</p> <p>Through the sale of individual parcels, the City was able to secure funds that were then used to renovate the Cathedral Palms housing to benefit a greater number of lower income and elderly residents.</p>	<p>Continue partnership with Riverside County to address this program.</p> <p>Change Program numbering to 2.B.3</p>
Policy 2.D <i>Promote and preserve mobile home parks for their value as extremely low, very low, low and moderate income housing opportunities.</i>				
Program 2.D.1 Any conversion of existing mobile home parks to permanent housing will continue to be regulated by ordinance to ensure that an appropriate relocation plan for park residents is developed and implemented. In addition, the City will seek to ensure that existing mobile home parks are meet current standards until such time that they are converted to permanent housing.	Community Development Department, Housing Successor Agency, Code Compliance	On-going as part of the review of any proposal to convert a mobile home park	This program continues to be implemented. To date, there have been no mobile home park conversions within the 5 th Cycle RHNA.	Continue
Program 2.D.2 Maintain a mobile home rent control ordinance which protects all mobile home residents who do not have long-term lease agreements.	Housing Successor Agency	On-going per City Ordinance 48	This program continues to be implemented.	Continue

Program/Action	Responsible Agency	Schedule	Accomplishments	Future Policies and Actions
Policy 2.E <i>Continue to redevelop the Downtown with higher density housing and encourage mixed use development where residential units are above commercial businesses.</i>				
Program 2.E.1 Continue to pursue prototype higher-density housing in the Downtown area to further the concepts of mixed use in the urban core.	Community Development Department, City Manager's office	On-going as part of the development review process and the annual Housing Element review	The City has, and continues to have, ongoing meetings with developers who desire to take advantage of the higher density zoning within the City's downtown zones. Several mixed-use housing project plans have been submitted and reviewed by the City during the 5 th Cycle; however, no projects were taken through to the development phase. The City continues to maintain the higher density zoning in its Downtown core to encourage such uses where the necessary infrastructure exists.	Continue
Program 2.E.2 Maintain provisions in the Zoning Ordinance which allow for residential uses in the second story of commercial centers in the Downtown area.	Community Development Department	On-going per City ordinance	This program continues to be implemented.	Continue
Policy 2.F <i>The City shall encourage crime-free housing programs for all projects constructed in the City.</i>				
Program 2.F.1 All projects shall be reviewed by the Police and Fire Departments to ensure that adequate security and 'defensible space' is provided.	Community Development Department, Police Department, Fire Department	On-going as part of the development review process	This program continues to be implemented.	Continue
Program 2.F.2 All assisted affordable housing projects will comply with the precepts for Crime-Free Housing.	Housing Successor Agency, Community Development Department, Police Department	On-going as part of the development review process	This program continues to be implemented.	Continue. Modify program text to refer to "defensible space" and remove the term "Crime-Free Housing"

Program/Action	Responsible Agency	Schedule	Accomplishments	Future Policies and Actions
GOAL 3: The maintenance and rehabilitation of the City's residential neighborhoods.				
Policy 3.A <i>Ensure that the quality of dwelling units in existing neighborhoods is improved, conserved, rehabilitated and maintained.</i>				
Program 3.A.1 Maintain the Sewer Hook-up Assistance Redevelopment Program (SHARP), allowing grants and loan assistance programs for qualifying extremely-low-, very-low-, low-, and moderate-income households in order to encourage the rehabilitation of existing housing units as funding permits.	Housing Successor Agency, Community Development Department	Annual budget allocations as funding permits. Funding limited/not available due to dissolution of Redevelopment Agency.	The SHARP Program was a program managed by the City's Administrative Services Department. When Cathedral City became an Entitlement city in 2012, the City offered CDBG revolving sewer loans to low and moderate-income residents. A small number of these applicants made payments on their loans while the City recuperated balance for other loans when the applicants refinanced or sold their properties.	Program was discontinued.
Program 3.A.2 All City codes, including the California Building Code, will be enforced in the City's Building Division and Code Compliance Division, so that existing units are maintained in good repair.	Community Development Department; Police Department/Code Compliance Division	On-going enforcement	This program continues to be implemented.	Continue. Remove "Police" from responsible agency and add "Planning and Building Department."
Program 3.A.3 Develop a rehabilitation and neighborhood revitalization plan for that area north of Dinah Shore Drive, generally west of Date Palm Drive, known as the Whitewater neighborhood, which targets short-, medium-, and long-range plans for the rehabilitation of existing duplexes, and the development of quality single-family housing.	Community Development Department	2014-2016	Using CDBG Funds, street improvements have been completed for 3 residential blocks. Over the next two years, both CDBG and SB1 Funds will be used to improve additional streets.	This program is ongoing.
Program 3.A.4 Maintain an inventory that lists existing neighborhoods with substandard infrastructure, including partially paved roads, substandard water lines, flooding problems, absence of sewer service and lack of street lighting, quantify the need for improvements and identify funding sources.	Community Development Department, Public Works Division	Once every 5 years, to be completed prior to 2016	A Pavement Management Plan is prepared for implementation and an inventory of the City's streets and street conditions is maintained. The City does not maintain inventory for water/sewer/flooding. SCE owns streetlights. City coordinates with CVWD, DWA, RivCo Flood Control District, etc. who are responsible for these individual systems.	This program is ongoing.

Program/Action	Responsible Agency	Schedule	Accomplishments	Future Policies and Actions
Program 3.A.5 Analyze the development potential for the area northeast of East Palm Canyon and Golf Club Drive, and consider programming infrastructure improvements, including roadway improvements, signalization of Cree Road and East Palm Canyon Drive, and provision of sewer and water improvements to encourage development of affordable housing in the area.	Community Development Department, Public Works Division	2014-2016	This area is nearly completely re-developed as a single-family residential community (The District and District East) and Assisted Living Facility (Horizon Gardens). The developer made roadway and drainage improvements in the areas fronting and off-site of the development and water and sewer purveyors to make the required infrastructure improvements.	Program was completed and is no longer necessary.
Program 3.A.6 The Code Compliance Division of the Police Department shall continue to maintain and upgrade living conditions in those neighborhoods with serious endemic problems to ensure safe, sanitary, and healthy living condition throughout all neighborhoods of the City through existing and future programs such as the Graffiti Elimination Program.	Graffiti Task Force, Police Department/Code Compliance Division	On-going	Code Compliance and Public Works Divisions continue to operate and assist in upgrading those neighborhoods with serious endemic problems. The Graffiti removal program has been very successful in removing graffiti and maintaining clean and orderly buildings.	Continue. Modify program text to indicate graffiti abatement is done by a 3 rd party vendor through the Public Works Department. No longer Police Department responsibility.
Program 3.A.7 Bring to City Council the option of incorporating the Uniform Housing Code into the City's Municipal Code as a tool for Code Enforcement to encourage proper maintenance of owner-occupied and rental properties.	Police Department/Code Compliance Division, Community Development Department	2014-2015	The City adopted the California Building Code (CBC) in place of the Uniform Housing Code. The CBC was incorporated into Chapter 8 of the City's Municipal Code. (ref. CCMC Section 8.02.030).	Program was completed and the UHC is now a tool used to encourage maintenance of residential structures.